

# Joint Submission to the Industry Standards Consultation

20 December 2023

//

Dear Commissioner Inman Grant,

We the undersigned organisations and individuals urge you to protect the privacy and security of communications and cloud file storage for internet users.

We acknowledge the severity of harm caused by the dissemination of child sexual abuse material (CSAM) and other forms of illegal content, and we support strong regulation to ensure platform accountability, the empowerment of users as well as the protection of their rights and safety. It is essential that governments, with the support of industry, take effective steps to regulate the spread of illegal content. It is also essential that such approaches do not also disproportionately lead to the creation and exacerbation of other harms, and adopt best practices in international policy making.

The eSafety Commissioner has proposed two draft industry standards<sup>1</sup> (1) under the Online Safety Act. Taken together, these standards apply to a broad range of services that people use every day including email, text and instant messaging, video communications, online gaming, dating services, and online file storage. In a context in which cybersecurity risks are rising, the safety, rights, and wellbeing of individuals and communities rely on the digital security and the privacy of these services.

Both draft standards include a range of proactive detection obligations on digital services to scan content in order to detect, remove, disrupt and deter CSAM and 'pro-terror' content. There are no specific safeguards for end-to-end encrypted services that people rely on for privacy and safety, as content on such platforms cannot be accessed by any third party, including the service provider, at any stage of the communication/storage process. Hashing and artificial intelligence technologies are specifically referenced to detect and remove objectionable content. Such approaches, when deployed on a device, are commonly referred to as 'client side scanning.' These methods have been widely criticised by privacy and security researchers, digital rights advocacy organisations and human rights groups around the world.<sup>2</sup> Internet safety advocates and child rights groups have emphasised the importance of looking at other methods to enhance online safety for children and minimise the dissemination of CSAM, and how encryption works to protect the rights of children.<sup>3</sup> Scanning technologies are deeply flawed because they: have questionable effectiveness;

---

<sup>1</sup> See two draft industry standards: <https://www.esafety.gov.au/industry/codes/standards-consultation>

<sup>2</sup> See, for example, this open letter in response to the EU's proposed Child Sexual Abuse Regulation, signed by over 450 scientists and researchers: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/13Aeex72MtFBjKhExRTTooVMWN9TC-pbH-5LEaAbMF91Y/edit>

<sup>3</sup> See, for example, 'Privacy and Protection: A children's rights approach to encryption,' Child Rights International Network, 19 January 2023, which concludes technologies including client-side scanning is akin to breaking encryption by compromising its aims, and points to other underutilised safety mechanisms such as user reporting, <https://home.crin.org/readlistenwatch/stories/privacy-and-protection>; and 'Chat Control or Child Protection?' Ross Anderson, Foundation for Information Policy Research, October 2022 which notes alternative methods to tech solutionism to enhance safety, <https://www.cl.cam.ac.uk/~rja14/Papers/chatcontrol.pdf>.

contain a high risk of false positives; increase vulnerabilities to security threats and attack – thereby weakening online safety for all users – and enable the ability to expand use of such systems to scan other categories of content in the future.<sup>4</sup>

The eSafety Commissioner has publicly stated that it supports privacy and security, and does not advocate building in weaknesses or back doors to undermine end-to-end encrypted services.<sup>5</sup> But client-side scanning fundamentally undermines encryption's promise and principle of private and secure communications and personal file storage. We urge the Commissioner against creating standards that would force encrypted services to implement such scanning measures as they would create an unreasonable and disproportionate risk of harm to individuals and communities.

Australia is a leader in the field of online safety policy making, and this position comes with responsibility in shaping the norms and direction of international internet governance and regulation. Proceeding with the standards as drafted would signal to other countries that online safety is somehow counterposed to privacy and security, when the opposite is true.

We strongly urge the eSafety Commissioner to amend the proposed industry standards to ensure the protection of privacy and security, and urge the Australian Government to commit to the ongoing protection and strengthening of encryption, privacy and digital security.

Sincerely,

The following undersigned organisations and individuals,

---

<sup>4</sup> For further detail on the risks of client side scanning see: 'Fact Sheet: Client-Side Scanning', Internet Society 24 March 2020, <https://www.internetsociety.org/resources/doc/2020/fact-sheet-client-side-scanning/>; and 'Bugs in our Pockets: The Risks of Client-Side Scanning,' 14 October 2021, <https://arxiv.org/abs/2110.07450>.

<sup>5</sup> See 'Updated Position Statement: End-to-end encryption,' October 2023 <https://www.esafety.gov.au/sites/default/files/2023-10/End-to-end-encryption-position-statement-oct2023.pdf>; and 'Australia releases new online safety standards to tackle terror and child sexual abuse content,' The Guardian, 20 November 2023, <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2023/nov/20/australia-esafety-standards-new-2023-targets-child-content-terrorism-detection>.

## Organisations

Access Now	Fabiano Law Firm	Mozilla
Africa Media and Information Technology Initiative (AfriMITI)	Fight for the Future	NAPWHA
ARTICLE 19	Fusion Party Australia	Open Rights Group
Assembly Four	Global Partners Digital	OPTF
Associação Portuguesa para a Promoção da Segurança da Informação (AP2SI)	Hello Code Pty Ltd	Privacy & Access Council of Canada
Betapersei SC	Internet Association of Australia	Proton
Blueprint for Free Speech	Internet Australia (Internet Society of Australia)	Seraf Inc.
Center for Democracy and Technology	Internet Freedom Foundation	Signal
Centro Latinoamericano de Investigaciones Sobre Internet (CLISI)	Internet Society	Signal Labs
Digital Rights Watch	Internet Society Ghana	Superbloom (previously known as Simply Secure)
eclectic.engineering P/L	Interpeer Project	The Ruffle Technology Company
Electronic Frontiers Australia	IT-Pol Denmark	The Sizzle
	JCA-NET(Japan)	The Tor Project
	LGBT Technology Partnership	Tuta

## Individuals\*

\*Affiliation for identification purposes only

Romney Adams	Toby Allen	Matt Andrews
Zafer Saeed A Ahmad	Shereen Almagzoub	Ambrose Andrews
Michael Airey	Robert Amos	Sherry Armstrong
Shane Alderton	Leroy Anderson	Tommaso Armstrong
Pat Allan	brian anderson	Reginald Ashman
Jamie Allen	Thomas Anderson	Michael Astle

Daniel Axtens	David Blackwell	Richard Burke
Jade B	Julie Blackwell	Julianna Burke
Ramon Baba	Cees Boekel	Sam Burnett
Katherine Back	Oliver Boermans	Adrian Burns
nicola badran	Luke Boner	Brodie Burns-williamson
Melanie Bakewell	Matthew Boniface	Angela Cadwallen
Veronica Ball	Andrew Bonte	Peter Caffin
Paora Balzer	Pieter Bos	Carlos Calero
Nic Barbaro	Sarah Botham	Evan Cameron
Marcus Barczak	Constantine Bourlioufas	John Cameron
Jason Barker	Jarah Bowman	Leigh Carey
Chris Barry	Nicholas Boyle	Michael Carino
Hamish Bassett	Sean Boys	Madeline Carlier
Lyn Barwick	Marcie Breen	Clancy Carr
Alana Becker	Philip Briggs	Jayden Carslake
Stuart Begg	han broekman	Georgina Carson
Bradley Bell	Gregor Brown	Graham Castles
Toni Bentley	John Brown	Matthew Cengia
Michel Bergeron	Alannah Brown	Travis Charlton
Jordan Bertasso	Vin Brown	Paul Cheshire
Benjamin Beshara	Damion Brown	Sishoon Chow
Fares Bessrou	Sam Buckberry	James Clark
Stuart Biggs	Jon Burdach	Aidan Clarke, Principle DevOps Evangelist, Atlassian
Christopher Biggs	Rollin Burford	
Michelle Black	Phil Burg	Brady Clarke
Adam Blackhall	Donald Burgess	Denise Clarke

Tim Cleaver	Bruce Davie, co-founder and publisher, Systems Approach, LLC	Megan Edwards
Jake Cleland		Alex Egan
Daniel Clibborn	Shaun deans	Steve Evans
Phillip Cochrane	Stephen Dedman	Elisa Ewer
Garth Coghlan	Mark Delany	Ryan Fearnall
Trevor Collins	Quincy Denham	zev feldman
Josephine Colson, Head of Marketing, Cremorne Digital Hub	Marcus Denny	Matt Fenn
Adrian Cook	Andrew Dent	Edoardo Ferrero
Greg Cooper	Nakul Deshmukh	John Ferrero
Steel Cooper	Deon Deszcz	Lucas Ficarra
Erica Corr	Mark Devenish	Mathew Fidge
Sean Corrigan	Marco Di Leo	Ben Finney
Lachlan Costigan	Andy Do	Samantha Floreani
Tavishe Coulson	Rebecca Dominguez	Tara Force
Neill Cox	Mark Dorset	Linda Ford
Rob Craig	Kim Dowling	joseph frawley
Andrew Crane	Iain Dowling	Chris Fredericks
Petar Crnomarkovic	Andrew Downing	Nick Freeland
Brian Crowley	Nick Doyle	Neville Fryar
Owen Curteis	wojtek dr	Nancy Gabauer
James Cutler	Craig Drewer	Josh Gardner
Adam D'Alessandro	Darcy Driscoll, Software Engineer, Professionals Australia	Charles Gascoigne
Simon Daigle	Gareth Dunstone	Stephen Gentle
Andreas Dalman	Peter Dutch	Darren Gibbs
Maria Dancuk	Odin Dutton	Beau Gieskens, Software Engineer
	Tim Edwards	Christopher Giffard

Kevin Gil	Mark Hansen	Baden Hughes
Evan Gilbert	Tracy Hawes	Scott Humphries
wayne gipters dj	Brad Hayes	Allan Hunt
Chery Gladman	Ric Hayman	Dirk Hunter
Callum Glennen	Paige Headington	Michael Hurren
Matthew Godfrey	Virginia Heal	John Hussey
Hollie Goik	James Hebden	Mark Hutton
Daniel Gomes	Natalie Hendry	Patrik Hyytiäinen
Jason Goroncy	Nicholas Henry	Sam Ibrahim
Jarrah Gosbell	Mark Henry	Steven Impson
Daniel Govier	Menno Hess	Jett Jackson
Nathan Grant	adrian hewitt	Alexandra James
Angus Gratton	Adam Hickey	Trevor Jenke
Aaron Graves	Ben Hickleton	Joshua Jennings
Taylor Greig	Brendan Hidetake	Mark Johnson
Matthew Gretton	Allen Higginbottom	Jerrie Johnston
Michael Grey	Andrew Hill	Jacob Johnston
Joao Grilo	Christopher Hocking	Martin Jones
Nick Grundy	Lindsay-Leigh Hocking	Nivin Jose
Michał Grygierzec	Joshua Hodgkinson	Rowan K
Jon H	Stephan Holle	Kaan Karaoglu
Robin Haeusler	Lindsay Holmwood	Tace Kelly
David Geoffrey Hall	Michael Honey	mark kerr
Mark Halliwell	O Hooper	Dave Kerr
Damian Halloran	Kevin Hsueh	Monique Kerr
Simon Handfield	Robert Hudson	Alex Kesik
		Alex Keynes

Garth Kidd	Robin Lao	Robert Madell
Marian Kiely	Paul Latoszek	Darren Major
Stephen King	Chun Ming Lau	James Man
Brayden King	Mark Lauer	Diana Mangion
Nazar Kirama	Jon Lawrence	Trevor March
Amy Kirwan	Jamie Le	Tim Marriage
Mariusz Klochowicz	River Leah	Debra Marriott
Matthew Kobayashi	Arron Lee	Kara Martin
Thea Koutsoukis	Ryan Lester	Tom Marwick
Luke Kowald	Ben Lever	Michelle Masterd
Nathan Kowald	Peter Lewis	John Mautz
Sebastian Krapf	Peter Lieverdink	David Mazzei
Matthew Krins, Cyber Security Teacher, Box Hill Institute	Dylan Lindgren	Robert McAlavey
Erin Kruck	Eric Lindsay	Laurie McAnulty
Michael kruck	Kate Linton	Joseph McCrossin
Neville Kruck	Hugo Lisiecki	Caitlin McGrane
Rod Kruse	Grant Lockwood	Jamie McGuire
Myles Kunzli	John Logan	Gregory McIntyre
Henry L	Chris Lovell	Craig McIntyre
Bob Lacey	Alma Lucas	Courtney McKenzie
Angus Ladyman-Palmer	Robert Lugton	John McKinsey
Basil Lambert	Simone Lymbery	Sam McLeod
Kim Langer	Tamara Macadam	greg mcleod
Wendy Langer	Sean Mackedie	Amy McMurtrie
Sean Lanigan	Keelan Macpherson	Dion Meade
	Mary Macrae	Kim Meagher
	Peter Maddox	

Vincent Mellor	Thomas Nash	Martin Oliver
Mathias Ménard	Chris Naunton	Rebecca Oyomopito
Eli Mendez	Noely Neate	Vasilisa Paderina
Chris Menz	Anais Nedermeijer	Luci Pangrazio
Dale Miller	Lavender Neesham	Colin Panisset
Owen Miller	Chris Neilson	Brad Parker
Joseph Miller	Mark Newton	James Parker
Eddie Miller	Ronald Ng	James Parkinson
James Milne	Daniel Nicholls	keira Paterson
Charles Mok	Toby Nieboer	Tina Patterson
Dee Mooney-Pursell	Earanee Niedzwiecki	Natalie Pawlus
Lily Moor	Chris Nilsson	Tess Peer
DAmien Moore	Igor Nikitin	Susan Pegg
Jason Moore	Adrian Noblett	Jodie Pepper
Jake Moore	Jacqueline Norris-Burnett	Scott Percival
Wesley Moore	Peter Nunn	Philippe Petit
Tahnee Moore	Nicola Nye	Riana Pfefferkorn, Research Scholar, Stanford Internet Observatory
Bradley Morgan	Dylan O'Brien	
Patrick Morgan	Marni O'Connell	Christopher Phillips
Alice Morgan	Daniel O'Connor	Rachel Pickford
Jeremie Moroney	Daniel O'Connor	Angie Pisani
David Morrell	Nicholas O'Dwyer	Anthony Pitt
James Morris	Naomi O'Sullivan	A R Polack
Nicolas Mulder	Fiona O'Connor	Ryan Polk, Director, Internet Policy, Internet Society
Kieran Murphy	Tim O'Keefe	
James Murty	Eric O'Nyme	John Posar
	Alphonse Odhiambo	



Robert Postill	Eamon Rist	Christopher Scopa
Charlotte Price	Tina Rizza	Julia Scott-Stevenson
Andrew Price	Davide Rizzo	Hazel Seen
Leigh Price	Ben Robbins	Anker Segal
David Price	Matthew Roberts	Alexis Shaw
Ed Prism	David Robinson	Chris Shaw
Shaun Procter	Tom Robson	Shane Short
Glen Purkiss	R Rohde	Maddison Sideris
Jackie Radisich	andrew rossiter	Lachlan Simpson
Sumit Rajs	Igor Rozenberg	Ben Sinclair
Khen Ramos	Sophie Rudolph	Mike Sinclair
Ashlea Randle	Stanley Ruffo	Tim Singleton Norton
Tiago Rangel	Michael Ruigrok	Rob Sison
Tim Raphael	Simon Rumble	Geoffrey Skerratt
Eric Rasmussen	Greg Rush	Josephine Smart
Brett Raymond	Chris Russell	Phillip Smith
Brendan Read	Stuart Rutherford	James Smith
Olivier Rehani	Andrew Sadler	Michael Smith
J Reiman	Vignesh Sankaran	Tim Smith
Matt Relouw	Fushia Saulwick	Adam Smith-Platts
Dove Rengger-Thorpe	Jurgen Schaub	Internet Society
Moshe Reuveni	David Schinazi, Board Member, Internet Architecture Board	Simon Sonter
Ben Reynolds		Eliza Sorensen
Michelle Richards	Paul Schnackenburg	Leon Spencer
Elaine Richardson	Vicki Scholes	Ben Staggard
Owen Richardson	Sam Schuur	Zahra Stardust
Joshua Ridgway	Ben Schwarz	David Stastny

Shimmy Stauber	Matt Trappett	Jason Weathered
Janet Stephan	Alexandre Trotel	Craig Weavers
Josh Stephens	Martha Tsakalos	Kayleen White
Richard Stevenson	Lance Turner	Simon Whitehead
Jim Stewart	Nicholas Tzimos	Phil Whitehouse
Brody Stockel	Michael Usher	Ben Whitmore
Michael Strasser	Nicky V	Andreas Wilhelm
Michael Strasser	Thomas Van Deun	Lachlan Williams
Iain Stubbs	Gala Vanting	Dean Williams
Ales Sura	Christian Varga	Luke Williamson
Luke Sutton	Michael Velsigne	James Williamson
Katy Swain	Loganaden Velvindron, Founding Member, Cyberstorm.mu	Joshua Wilson
Olek Swierczynski		Ty Wilson-Brown
Krishna Tammireddy	Joshua Vermeulen	Joshua Withers
William Taylor	Karl von Muller	Withheld Withheld
Rob Taylor	Tim Walker	Grant Withington
justine teernstra	Kieran Wallace	Greg Wodetzki
Michael Terrington	Kenneth Wallace	Jonathan Wood
Maria Terzi	maize wallin	Andrew Woodforth
Andre Thomas	Aaron Walters	Ron Woods
Hamish Thorp	Paul Warren	Sharyn Woods
James Thurgood	Justin Warren	Vicki Woodward
Jon Tjhia	Connor Waterbanks	Simon Wooldridge
Jon Tjhia	Declan Watson	Trent Yarwood
Matt Toohey	Chris Watt	Erin Young
Luke Toop	Victoria Watts	Cédric Zeegers-Jourdain
ted tottenham		

Jackson Zhang

Lorna Zhulan

Justin Zobel

